Pledging money to deter sinning Posted by Dovid824 - 24 Aug 2018 19:56

Is pledging money to deter "falling" really the right thing to do?

In one sense, you could justify it by saying that whatever works is ok.

However, it reminds me of making a korban/offering to atone for a sin. But, in this case, does it really atone for the sin?

From my humble Talmud study, I've gotten the impression that for minor transgressions, a korban can be made to atone, and the sin is erased, as if it never happened. But for serious transgressions, there is no atonement. The sin remains on your "permanent record". The ultimate punishment, if any, is based on your future behavior, and is up to Hashem. (If my learning on this subject is faulty, please correct me.)

Just a thought.

Re: Pledging money to deter sinning Posted by Gevura Shebyesod - 24 Aug 2018 21:46

It's not an atonement, it's a deterrent.

Re: Pledging money to deter sinning Posted by Dovid824 - 24 Aug 2018 22:57

Gevura Shebyesod wrote on 24 Aug 2018 21:46:

It's not an atonement, it's a deterrent.

But if you fall and pay the pledged amount, might that be viewed as an atonement?

Re: Pledging money to deter sinning Posted by Markz - 26 Aug 2018 01:44

Dovid824 wrote on 24 Aug 2018 22:57:

Gevura Shebyesod wrote on 24 Aug 2018 21:46:

It's not an atonement, it's a deterrent.

But if you fall and pay the pledged amount, might that be viewed as an atonement?

CHAS VESHALOM

GEV IS NEVER GONNA FALL

And he didn't make no pledges

Dovid, can you be more specific. Are you considering pledge and have a concern?

Are you wondering why other people pledge?

====

Re: Pledging money to deter sinning Posted by Dovid824 - 26 Aug 2018 02:05

Markz wrote on 26 Aug 2018 01:44:

...

Dovid, can you be more specific. Are you considering pledge and have a concern?

Are you wondering why other people pledge?

It's a theoretical halachic question.

====