Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by Shivisi24/7 - 19 Jun 2019 22:10

Today in the chizuk email there was a quote from a sefer "Tikunot and Hadrachot". I am not familiar with this sefer and would like to know if anyone knows about it. My guess is that it is a relatively new sefer.

The reason for my interest is that the quote mentioned an idea that is very widespread - that Hashem doesn't give a person a nisayon that they can't overcome. There is a basic logic to this that an insurmountable nisayon is pointless, the person can't possibly gain schar or grow from it and punishment for the inevitable failure would be unfair.

The thing is that I remember hearing (and I at one point did look it up) that the Ramban in sefer Shaar Hagemul says something to the effect of this only being true in the context of tzadikim gemurim who face nisyonos for the purpose of showing the world their tzidkus and being mekadesh shem shamayim. For the rest of us it would seem then that our nisyonos could be chances for us to grow and get schar or also results of our avairos. But it is not guaranteed that we will overcome these nisyonos **or even that it is possible for us to overcome all of them.** I assume that in such a nisayon a person is not held responsible b'dinay shamayim for the failure that is beyond their abilities to withstand, otherwise it is really hard to understand.

I could be mistaken about the Ramban's meaning and others might argue on him. But does anyone know of an early source for the idea of all nisyonos being passable. Is there a Rishon or even a Gemara that implies this? Is it written in any seforim of baaley mussar or machshava? Many newer seforim I have seen that are chizuk seforim and also many sifrei chassidus mention it without a source but that it is taken for granted ("davar yadua...."). I would really like to know the original source of this very well known idea.

Shkoyach!

Re: Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by tzemach - 19 Jun 2019 22:41

There's a nice discussion about it here:

https://forum.otzar.org/viewtopic.php?f=17&t=22363

Here are some more on the topic of improper thoughts:

R' Chaim of Volozhin writes in Kesser Rosh Ch. 136:

Rabbi Tzvi Elimelech of Dinov in Derech Pikudecha, LS35.

Maamorei Shlomo Ch. 16

??? ??? ???? ????? ??"?, ???? ????? ?????? '??? ?????' ???????.

Tanya Ch. 27:

If, his sadness stems from sinful thoughts and desires enter his mind, then ... he should, on the contrary, be happy in his lot; for although these sinful thoughts enter his mind, he averts his attention from them. By averting his mind from sinful thoughts, he fulfills the mitzva, "You shall not follow after your heart and after your eyes, by which you go astray.", as chazal have said: "When one passively abstains from sin, he is rewarded as though he had actively performed a mitzvah." Consequently, he should rejoice in his compliance with the injunction just as he does when performing an actual mitzvas asei. On the contrary, such sadness is due to conceit... for were he to recognize his level, that he is very far from the rank of a true tzaddik, then surely, this is the challenge Hashem gives to the the Beinonim: To subdue the evil impulse and the thought that rises from the heart to the mind, and to completely avert his mind from it, repulsing it as it were with both hands. With every repulsion of this thought from his mind, the sitra achra is

suppressed... Therefore, one should not feel depressed or very troubled at heart, even if he be engaged all his days in this conflict with the thoughts which will always enter his mind. For perhaps this is what he was created for, and this is the service demanded of him — to subdue the sitra achra constantly.

==

* I wasn't able to find such a taz...

====

Re: Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by ColinColin - 19 Jun 2019 23:10

My guess, without textual basis.

There is no logical point in being given a nisayon that one cannot overcome.

Because if it is 100 percent not possible to overcome it, then it is not a nisayon.

But do we always know what nisayons are given to us...either at the time they are given, or with hindsight?

Re: Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by lionking - 20 Jun 2019 03:05

Shivisi24/7 wrote on 19 Jun 2019 22:10:

...

Many newer seforim I have seen that are chizuk seforim and also many sifrei chassidus mention it without a source but that it is taken for granted ("davar yadua...."). I would really like to know the original source of this very well known idea.

Shkoyach!

I once heard from a adom gadol that the source for that is kevira. We find in the gemora proof to the contrary. Sometimes Hashem gives people a nisoyin they cannot overcome, see for example Chet HaEigel, and Dovid with BasSheva. Additionally there is mention in Chassidishe seforim thos concept of not being given a chance. It's something we don't understand, the whole concept of Bechira and Yediya, and we cannot apply it whenever we want to say, oh, I couldn't overcome it.

Re: Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by lionking - 20 Jun 2019 03:05

Shivisi24/7 wrote on 19 Jun 2019 22:10:

•••

Many newer seforim I have seen that are chizuk seforim and also many sifrei chassidus mention it without a source but that it is taken for granted ("davar yadua...."). I would really like to know the original source of this very well known idea.

Shkoyach!

I once heard from a adom gadol that the source for that is kevira. We find in the gemora proof to the contrary. Sometimes Hashem gives people a nisoyin they cannot overcome, see for example Chet HaEigel, and Dovid with BasSheva. Additionally there is mention in Chassidishe seforim thos concept of not being given a chance. It's something we don't understand, the whole concept of Bechira and Yediya, and we cannot apply it whenever we want to say, oh, I couldn't overcome it.

====

Re: Nisayon you can't overcome?? Posted by Workingguy - 23 Jun 2019 04:24

ColinColin wrote on 19 Jun 2019 23:10:

My guess, without textual basis.

There is no logical point in being given a nisayon that one cannot overcome.

Because if it is 100 percent not possible to overcome it, then it is not a nisayon.

But do we always know what nisayons are given to us...either at the time they are given, or with hindsight?

How about to fail, and grow, so you can do better next time and really acquire something big?