

Halachic question

Posted by mayimtehorim - 10 Jan 2012 19:34

I posted this on Married forum, but I am new here and perhaps this is a better place to get an answer I am looking for. I am having difficulty understanding the issur of SZ"L.

With Shabbos for example, I see a direct line of reasoning: the lav is clearly and distinctively mentioned in the chumash >> mishna >> gemarrah >> halacha.

I fail to see that same line of reasoning with MZ"L. It seems to me that the Onen's principal aveyra in the Chumash was not MZ"L, but rather his avoidance of having children. MZ"L is not mentioned in the Mishna at all. In the Gemarrah it is mentioned as a very negative activity to avoid at all costs, but it is not clear at all whether this is an issur based on halacha Moshe miSinai or some lav based on medical advice of the time (which we don't usually follow).

Then, seemingly out of nowhere, you have the Rishonim, Shulchan Aruch, the poskim and Kabbalah come and make this the worst aveyrach possible. My yetzer keeps on telling me that this is based on Kaboloh only and, as such, is a chumra (or a medrega of sorts). Where is the basis for the jump from no real lav in chumash, mishna, gemarrah to MZ"L being the worst of the worst in Halacha sefarim?

Moreover, only select few follow Kaboloh to the dot. Disregarding tumah and Kaboloh, spiritual and emotional reasons, is there a real halachic issur and what is the firm basis for this issur?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by ontheedgeman - 10 Feb 2012 13:59

I think you have your answer Jack. There is a dispute in Halacha, most believe the issur is D'Oreisa, a small minority say it's D'Rebbonen.

When it comes to feeling "guilty" over our previous "sins", we rely on the minority who say it's

d'Robbenen so that we can stop feeling guilty and start getting better in terms of mental health.

All this is found in the Teshuvah of the OnTheEdger Rebbe.

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by ur-a-jew - 10 Feb 2012 15:24

[jack wrote on 10 Feb 2012 13:52:](#)

you all have missed my point - i am very aware that knowing if it's d'oraysa wont help us to stop - but taking into consideration that we do it NOT because we want to transgress G-d's laws, but because of an addiction, my main point is this: AFTER WE HAVE SINNED, HOW GUILTY SHOULD WE FEEL? BECAUSE IF WE FEEL GUILTY, SURPRISINGLY ENOUGH, WE WILL DO IT AGAIN! GUILT IS SUPPOSED TO BE BEFORE WE DO THE ACT, NOT AFTER. so, if it's not d'oraysa, we will feel less guilty and there's more of a chance that we can heal. the guilt of doing a d'oraysa is debilitating.

jack

I agree with you that guilt can cause depression which can then cause a person to act it. BUT a person should not comfort himself that he "only" transgressed a derabbonon. Rabbeini Yonah in Sharei Teshuva (Chelek Gimmel, 4-8) makes this clear. To quote the Meor Hashaar:

???? ???? ?????? ?????? ?? ?????? ?????? ?? ??, ??? ?? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??? ?????? ?????
??? ?????? ?????, ?????? ?????? ?????? ?????? (??? ???) ?????? ??? ??? ?????? ?????? ?????? ??????
?????? ???

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 10 Feb 2012 15:34

I feel very guilty when I do something really stupid. What's wrong with that?

Yes, the guilt pain of masturbating does require many people to medicate all over again. So?

Too many newbies make what they think is a 'recovery call' - but really they just want the 'older' guy on the other end to make them feel better. They are desperate for that one thing and that one thing only. It's BS (pardon my french), and it will not help them get sober, at all.

Yes, feeling badly about doing something that is bad for me has bad side-effects. But so does going to work, driving, cleaning up after your child throws up on the floor, etc... So? It's gotta be done.

It **is** evil for me to masturbate - but if I am an addict, that fact is *irrelevant* to me quitting. It **is** evil for me to use porn, look at a woman and undress her with my eyes, focus on how 'hot' Hashem made her, etc...but that fact is **irrelevant** in getting me free of the compulsion. There is some unpleasant work that I cannot avoid, like facing the truth about my choices, powerlessness, failure, and lifestyle.

Masturbating, fantasizing, and porning - even if it were *100% mutar*...wait - *even if it was a mitzvah* - is and always was self-destructive to me. period. I abuse it like an alkie abuses

There are times when it

is a good thing, actually...but not for a frum alcoholic. For him, getting drunk on Purim is like having sex with his niddah wife or a prostitute - it is destructive, even deadly. Is that not evil? Drinking wine for kiddush or the four kosos is evil for him, and as Chaza"l say, **sakanta chamirah me'isurah**.

This is derech eretz, not a mitzvah-issue - **if one is an addict**. Just cuz it overlaps issur - that is pure distraction, totally irrelevant - *for one who is unable to stop and if it is risking or damaging his real life*.

None of this is true for the average Jew, who simply masturbates once in a blue moon because he really, really likes the way that a good orgasm with himself feels. That is what He made

Teshuvah (ila'ah) for, not recovery.

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by jack - 10 Feb 2012 15:45

the sole reason i did not abandon this struggle was because of the gentleness and non-guilt i feel when r' guard speaks to me. most of you don't remember debbiesteinerwins, who did the worst things imaginable, yet, r' guard treated her so gently. and rabbi reisman's shiur on this topic is so crucial. and rabbi feldman's chapter on homosexuality in 'eye of the storm' speaks with understanding. i am still here for one reason - because r' guard treats me with understanding, respect and not anger. in my mind, that is the main reason why this site is so successful. in my mind, anyone who thinks that the way to make someone better is to yell and scream and make one feel guilty, is just plain wrong. in fact, that's why most of us got into this predicament in the first place - from being made to feel guilty. in some jewish yeshivahs you can't even ask a question! gevalt! questioning is the jewish way! how do you pass on the mesorah? what is the seder all about? QUESTIONS!! how can any jewish person think that questions are no good? so we look for an escape - somewhere we can feel good. and for us, it was porn. in my fourth year of recovery, i am trying to replace the porn with something GOOD that feels good.

good - i said my piece.

jack

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 10 Feb 2012 15:50

That was nice, thanks. Love is what got me into SA and keeps me in SA meetings. When I met all kinds of people who love me just because I am sick like they are, that was a ground-breaker for me.

Two questions for my education: Did I post anything to you that put you down for *asking*? Was anything I wrote unloving?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Me3 - 10 Feb 2012 15:56

hey Jack nobody is denying you the right to ask questions, we (the ones who didn't actually give you ma'amer mekomos) just feel that the question and the answer is irrelevant to recovery. More so we feel that this is a critical point to understand. I don't see anybody yelling at you although people do feel strongly about this topic.

But yell? Be angry? At Jack? How could anybody be angry at Jack? We love Jack! Anybody here who has a problem with Jack needs to go through me first! Kapish?????

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 10 Feb 2012 16:26

Let's not forget what started all this:

[mayimtehorim wrote on 10 Jan 2012 19:34:](#)

I posted this on Married forum, but I am new here and perhaps this is a better place to get an answer I am looking for. I am having difficulty understanding the issur of SZ"L.

With Shabbos for example, I see a direct line of reasoning: the lav is clearly and distinctively mentioned in the chumash >> mishna >> gemarrah >> halacha.

I fail to see that same line of reasoning with MZ"L. It seems to me that the Onen's principal aveyra in the Chumash was not MZ"L, but rather his avoidance of having children. MZ"L is not mentioned in the Mishna at all. In the Gemarrah it is mentioned as a very negative activity to avoid at all costs, but it is not clear at all whether this is an issur based on halacha Moshe

miSinai or some lav based on medical advice of the time (which we don't usually follow).

Then, seemingly out of nowhere, you have the Rishonim, Shulchan Aruch, the poskim and Kabbalah come and make this the worst aveyrach possible. My yetzer keeps on telling me that this is based on Kabboloh only and, as such, is a chumra (or a medrega of sorts). Where is the basis for the jump from no real lav in chumash, mishna, gemarrah to MZ"L being the worst of the worst in Halacha sefarim?

Moreover, only select few follow Kabboloh to the dot. Disregarding tumah and Kabboloh, spiritual and emotional reasons, is there a real halachic issur and what is the firm basis for this issur?

Where is this fellow now?

There was a fellow who would pop up on GYE every six months or year or so, can't recall his name..but there was also a "southafricanJew" member who did the same thing here once...maybe it was him. Guard mentioned him to me after I posted responses to some points of his on the forum, then later by email. The yid mainly wanted to explain why he is still occasionally masturbating himself and felt that it was very important for me to know that it was working for him. He wrote me that he asked a Rov about this, after explaining his situation to him, and was told that it was OK, based on the above points, if memory serves me.

Is this the same guy? I doubt it.

But I love that guy. Is his masturbation bringing a mabul? I do not know. Is he a horrible person? I doubt it. At the risk of being cast as a liberal, R"l, I see that plenty good people do somethings that are just plain wrong, stupid, etc. Hashem apparently 'realizes' that we **are** works in progress. I believe He looks at us as goofy little kids, period. Even in our *good* moments learning and davening and mesiras nefesh. To Him, I personally feel, we are His cute little bumbling babies - all dressed up in grown-up clothes and pretending to be smart, mature, sound, and good. And this even goes for rabbonim and talmidei chachomim, bobbies and zaidy's.

We try. Some of us are addicts, sick people. Some are not, but just drink too much or yell too much or hate too much or lie too much. Nu. None are perfect. He waits.

We just try.

What is the guy who waits for a 'clear issur' doing? Is he waiting? Is he trying? I do not know. But I think it is a favor when we point out to him that if he is living a double life unzipping his pants and getting to work in this way, then he is indeed a sick man. And if he'd really be a woman, then we'd say the same thing to him, i hope. for I know women in SA who do it and are sober for years, b"H, and there is no issur of zera levatola for them. It is destructive, abuse of sexuality. It takes up the entire mind, and it makes real life feel very irrelevant, people all seem like annoyances, and G-d seem like He hates us. All stupid lies.

I hope the real person behind 'mayimtehorim' finds whatever he is really looking for.

=====
=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by jack - 10 Feb 2012 16:45

ok, more of my story. (anyone play the violin?) for the first 40 years of my life (yes, some of your parents didn't even know each other yet when i was in diapers) i was yelled at, derided, in short, i felt like 2 cents.i started therapy when i was 27.it took 2 years of therapy and TWENTY YEARS of support to get out of that rut.every time i did something, anything, even something right, i was given a dirty look.those people are not here anymore, but i got to get those voices out of my head.i escaped into porn.i was stuck for nearly 40 years.most of you have not even seen 30 yet.i have a lot of red marks from those years (get out the kleenex).every time someone was angry with me, i escaped, i went further down, down, down.i cant let that happen anymore- i have to not let it affect me.i have to learn thousands of things.i am still overly sensitive - i know that, and i apologize.

jack

=====
=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by tehillimzugger - 11 Feb 2012 17:37

[censored wrote on 10 Feb 2012 15:32:](#)

tehillimzugger: why a girsa in smak? it is a mefurash gemuruh masechet nidduh around daf yud gimme, i believe. maybe you cited the smak because he is the only possek to view the gemuruh as anything but an assmachta be'alma. as rashi famously quotes lo sinna is about an eishes ish only.

You said that non of the monei hamitzvos count it so I pointed out that according to a girsa in smak (who is a moneh hamitzvos) it is counted.

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by tehillimzugger - 11 Feb 2012 17:50

[dov wrote on 10 Feb 2012 16:26:](#)

I know women in SA who do it and are sober for years, b"H, and there is no issur of zera levatola for them. It is destructive, abuse of sexuality. It takes up the entire mind, and it makes real life feel very irrelevant, people all seem like annoyances, and G-d seem like He hates us. All stupid lies.

good point

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by tehillimzugger - 11 Feb 2012 17:52

[jack wrote on 10 Feb 2012 15:45:](#)

most of you don't remember debbiesteinerwins, who did the worst things imaginable

www.guardyoureyes.org/forum/index.php?action=profile;area=showposts;u=84

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Blind Beggar - 11 Feb 2012 21:22

[Dov wrote on 10 Feb 2012 15:34:](#)

Masturbating, fantasizing, and porning - even if it were *100% mutar*...wait - *even if it was a mitzvah* - is and always was self-destructive to me. Period. I abuse it like an alkie abuses

There are times when it is a good thing, actually...but not for a frum alcoholic. For him, getting drunk on Purim is like having sex with his niddah wife or a prostitute - it is destructive, even deadly. Is that not evil? Drinking wine for kiddush or the four kosos is evil for him, and as Chaza"l say, **sakanta chamirah me'isurah**.

What a great statement. This whole thread would be kedai just for this.

=====
=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Reb Yid - 12 Feb 2012 05:30

[Blind Beggar wrote on 11 Feb 2012 21:22:](#)

[Dov wrote on 10 Feb 2012 15:34:](#)

Masturbating, fantasizing, and porning - even if it were *100% mutar*...wait - *even if it was a mitzvah* - is and always was self-destructive to me. Period. I abuse it like an alkie abuses
There are times when it
is a good thing, actually...but not for a frum alcoholic. For him, getting drunk on Purim is like having sex with his niddah wife or a prostitute - it is destructive, even deadly. Is that not evil? Drinking wine for kiddush or the four kosos is evil for him, and as Chaza"l say, **sakanta chamirah me'isurah**.

What a great statement. This whole thread would be kedai just for this.

I just finished quoting and formatting exactly what you did BB!!!

I even copied the same text from the quote!!

Way to go Reb Dov!!

Once again you hit a home run!!

Hatzlocha,

Reb Yid

=====
=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 12 Feb 2012 12:47

Funny. Jack is of course right about the love being the ikkar in the long run - demonstrating love to another is far more important than just 'putting them in their place at all costs'; *he* is the one who opens up voluntarily revealing his personal history and shows us all the way to actually *do*...and / hit the home run?

There is definitely a balance here that is delicate. Hashem ya'azor lanu....

=====
=====