

Halachic question

Posted by mayimtehorim - 10 Jan 2012 19:34

I posted this on Married forum, but I am new here and perhaps this is a better place to get an answer I am looking for. I am having difficulty understanding the issur of SZ"L.

With Shabbos for example, I see a direct line of reasoning: the lav is clearly and distinctively mentioned in the chumash >> mishna >> gemarrah >> halacha.

I fail to see that same line of reasoning with MZ"L. It seems to me that the Onen's principal aveyra in the Chumash was not MZ"L, but rather his avoidance of having children. MZ"L is not mentioned in the Mishna at all. In the Gemarrah it is mentioned as a very negative activity to avoid at all costs, but it is not clear at all whether this is an issur based on halacha Moshe miSinai or some lav based on medical advice of the time (which we don't usually follow).

Then, seemingly out of nowhere, you have the Rishonim, Shulchan Aruch, the poskim and Kabbalah come and make this the worst aveyrach possible. My yetzer keeps on telling me that this is based on Kaboloh only and, as such, is a chumra (or a medrega of sorts). Where is the basis for the jump from no real lav in chumash, mishna, gemarrah to MZ"L being the worst of the worst in Halacha sefarim?

Moreover, only select few follow Kaboloh to the dot. Disregarding tumah and Kaboloh, spiritual and emotional reasons, is there a real halachic issur and what is the firm basis for this issur?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by gibbor120 - 10 Jan 2012 20:07

This is a mishna, I think.

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Me3 - 10 Jan 2012 20:31

How long before Dov sees this and blows a gasket?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by gibbor120 - 10 Jan 2012 20:33

?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Blind Beggar - 10 Jan 2012 21:21

This is an easy one!

There are braysos in mesechta Kallosh Rabbosi perek 2 and a bit in perek 1. It is darshened from loads of pesukim in gemara Niddah daf 13. Smak mitzvah 292. Gemara Kesuvos 46a. Smag mitzvah 126. Ramban on Sefer Hamitzvos of the Rambam mitzvah 11. These are all droshos from pesukim.

wanna start a betting thread

It is all over Niddah 13. The Zohar is from the time of the Mishna.

Hatzlocho!

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Reb Yid - 07 Feb 2012 04:27

Wow BB!!!

That is some Bekiyus!!

I could only imagine what would be if you weren't so blind?

Keep Shteiging!!!

PS - Please see my post in the Balei Batim's Forum. That is where this all started.....

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 07 Feb 2012 06:02

[Me3 wrote on 10 Jan 2012 20:31:](#)

How long before Dov sees this and blows a gasket?

BUWAHAHAHAHAHAHAH!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!

ToO LAtE!!

Boom! HSssssssssssssssss.....

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Blind Beggar - 07 Feb 2012 10:52

[Reb Yid wrote on 07 Feb 2012 04:27:](#)

Wow BB!!!

That is some Bekiyus!!

I could only imagine what would be if you weren't so blind?

Keep Shteiging!!!

PS - Please see my post in the Balei Batim's Forum. That is where this all started.....

All from one sefer, actually.

Please post a link to your thread.

=====
=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Reb Yid - 07 Feb 2012 18:13

Here it is.

Let me know what you think.

I'd like to hear from mayimtehorim. I truly want to know if I am wrong in my assumptions.

www.guardyoureyes.org/forum/index.php?topic=4983.msg132504#msg132504

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by jack - 07 Feb 2012 19:04

i understand i may be going against the grain here - but i've done it before...

look at igros moshe in orach chaim chelek daled near the end of the chelek he has a teshuvah to someone he calls aleph,bays,gimel he says it doesn't ALWAYS end in misah bydei shamayim, r'l so it cant be d'oraysa - anyone disagree?

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 07 Feb 2012 21:08

I am an addict, so my truth is *far* more machmir than all the religious folk are. Misah bideai Shomayim, coreis, whatever...

For me, it is misah bidei Odom - me. I really kill myself when I lust and act out, R'l. It's not "spiritual" death, and no violins are needed, thank-you. If I'd have continued on the derech I started on, my wife and I both know I would be buried by today. No question that I'd be dead either by my own hand, by someone else's, or by STD.

And every day I slipped a little, it was the next nail in my coffin. Hey - if it went no where in the end and I just remained a guy who occasionally roamed the streets watching hookers, but never really risked my life, job, family, arrest, health, and standing in the community, then I'd probably still be out there. Cuz then I could afford it, so I would if I could. Living the life of a loser *is* acceptable to me, unfortunately. That's is just a fact I see from my history. That is where my **bechirah** gets me. If I still had the same old gayvah I used to have, I'd deny it. But it's been beaten out of me, a bit.

I only quit because I could not *afford* to continue. It finally became clear to me that I was on the path to death, unquestionably. It was just like driving with my eyes duct-taped over by someone - you just do not do it. You stop so you don't die, plain and simple. It doesn't *matter* how badly you need to get somewhere, you just stop going on. Very inconvenient, it is. There is no breirah. There is no ***bechirah***. So I stopped, and *not* because of bechirah, at all.

Bechirah not to die, I do not consider bechirah, at all. So I expect no s'char for being sober, either. As long as I was trying to get that brass ring of being 'bochair baTov', I failed and only got worse and worse.

And really *believing* this means a lot of things that change everyday life dramatically:

1- when I feel cheated of something, jealous, or sorry for myself, I can remember that by all rights I should be dead today and really anything I get is gravy, now;

2- when I want to lust, it is possible for me to admit that no matter how bad my current life situation may be, it will never be bad enough that acting out will *not* make it even worse;

3- it's hard to admit it, but if I hold onto a fantasy or a curious, imaginative thought in my head, at all - I will have *no* way of really being sure where I will *stop*;

4- being sober today is good enough for me, no matter what else happens or doesn't happen. I have no excuse for sadness, self-pity, etc...If I have those things (which I frequently do) then I need to work steps 4-7, quick;

5- lusting for anything Hashem has not prepared for me, is a sure way to misery, and I have had enough self-misery.

OK, so I was back on the soap-box. Sorry. But there are not too many places to actually

express myself, you know. Thanks for letting me share here, even if it's off topic.

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by jack - 07 Feb 2012 21:29

so reb dov, what's your knowledge about whether it's d'oraisa or not?

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Gevura Shebyesod - 07 Feb 2012 21:53

It's been a while since I last read that Teshuva (last summer) but I don't think he said that the Issur is not De'Oraisa. His point was that the Onesh of Misa is not mentioned in the Torah, so it's not the same level of Misa Biydei Shomayim as say a Zar eating Teruma.

Here's a link to it online:

<http://hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=14677&st=&pgnum=210>

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by tehillimzugger - 08 Feb 2012 13:38

[Gevura ShebYesod wrote on 07 Feb 2012 21:53:](#)

It's been a while since I last read that Teshuva (last summer) but I don't think he said that the Issur is not De'Oraisa. His point was that the Onesh of Misa is not mentioned in the Torah.

he doesn't seem to be sure of the onesh bichlal

=====

=====

Re: Halachic question

Posted by Dov - 08 Feb 2012 18:35

[jack wrote on 07 Feb 2012 21:29:](#)

so reb dov, what's your knowledge about whether it's d'oraisa or not?

Are you kidding me? I guess you are, and it's actually funny....or maybe you have significant holdings in a gasket manufacturing company....

In my first month on GYE there was this guy username "chusid", I think. He posted a question, asking exactly what was the actual issur of looking at pictures of naked women, after all. He seemed sincere (whatever *that* means).

He (and others who took the question seriously) cited a few issues al tzad heter, including the fact that the chazokah was that she is a *goyah*, that a *man* can really have more than one wife anyhow, that it is after all only a picture and not her *actual* skin or ervah, etc....not that anyone from GYE would ever matir such a thing, but just to face the issues they felt torn between.

Gevalt.

So I posted this to him (just found it, 2009!):

Dear Chosid,

You asked a good question, thank-you. This is something I thought about a lot during the years I acted out and used such things. The truth is, I could not stop doing it. I simply could not live without it. The reason I stopped had nothing to do with whether the Ribono Shel olam din't want me to look, or not. Because: I couldn't stop, even if the possuk said exactly what you are asking, word for word: "Thou shalt not look at p*** images of any kind, even in 'Sears' catalogues" for example. **As far as I know, there is no evidence that I could have stopped if I heard even Hashem Himself tell me not to do it.**

And I would not be surprised if you are exactly the same as me in this respect.

This is not a criticism of me nor of you, nor of Hashem! I simply could not stop. The proof I have, is that everything I did with all my koach to stop, failed, for years and even at the cost of great loss. This included medication, three shrinks, five or more rebbi's, a severe auto accident, and daily shame, regret, and fear. It simply never occurred to me - during almost 15 years of getting worse - that I need to do whatever it takes to stop or I will die. When it finally did, I got the help I needed and stopped. I still need to do things to **stay** stopped, and my life is wonderful now, I am with the Ribono Shel olam even more than I thought possible, my marriage is transformed and beyond anything we ever thought we could be zoiche to before.

Your question, innocent as it is, reminds me of what they say in the name of tzaddikim: A person can learn and daven many hours of the day, be honest kehalochah in business, make brochos w/two coverings on his head for food and nizhar in shabbos, etc. Then we ask him when he spends time thinking about the Ribono Shel olam and he says: Who has time for that? I am too busy being a yid! Tell me, besides our guilty, shameful moments, when do we feel completely alone, in secret with Hashem yisborach? In a place nobody else knows? Not just thinking about Him like a math problem of getting change at the store or because we happen to be in krias Shema and saying the words "Havayah echod" - I mean thinking in a relationship - just like you think about your wife, or someone you are speaking with? Simple, plain emunah chushis: "We are together, Hashem and me, and of course that is just great! The Master and boirei is with me right now." When do we think this? When does anybody? The question you ask is the same as asking: what is wrong with a yid who keeps kol ahtorah kulah but has no individual relationship whatsoever with his Tatteh en himmel? The Chovos Halevovos makes it clear that the goal of the world, the Torah and Mitzvos, is to create a individual, beautiful, personal relationship with the Borei Olam inside the living heart of each and every yid. When I was doing the sick stuff, I had only a guilt-yearning type of relationship with my Tatteh, very

confused and very useless to all around me and perhaps to myself as well. That is the "possuk" that says it is "ossur" to look at what you ask.

Who cares if it is an issur deoraisa, derabbonon, or none at all? Do you really care? I challenge you to try to stop. If you can't, then sorry but *it* is ruling over you and you **are** serving it and not the Ribono Shel olam. We are not chesboning about an aveira issue here, at all. We are talking about living like a nut. (Actually, as a chosid you should understand because the chidush of chasidus is about the unwritten part, the motivation to keep the halocha and the relationship with Hashem, not halocha itself. Every litvishe kept and keeps halocha. No?)

Nothing I have written is personal, or critical in any way, just an observation - this is how it is with me, should I decide to let go of my recovery program and forsake myself. May Hashem help us all do the best we can with His help. I was not able to get His help until I worked the 12 steps because my life depended on it. Period. No halocha issue here, just plain 100% pikuach nefesh. I love you and hope you understand what I am writing, heilige yid.

I wonder is he is still out there somewhere, having sex with himself or somebody else, today, or just using porn and bargaining with G-d as if He really cares about 'madreigos' and 'goodness', while a Jew is killing himself and ruining his family.

Today I would just say something like, "and after all your curiosity is satisfied, do you still think things would be any different than they have been *till* now? Are you not asking this question because you already do look at pornography yourself, and masturbate over it sometimes, too? If you do not, that's nice. But if you already *have* this problem, then how about coming out and admitting the facts about you, instead of just hiding behind a pretend halachik issue *that wouldn't stop you in the end anyway because **it has not stopped you till now?***"

Boy, have I gotten crusty since 2009....

Love you, Jack!

- Dov

=====

=====