

Masechtes Music

Posted by UTS - 14 Jul 2009 19:42

Disclaimer:

The following should be discussed with an insightful rov if applicable.

What brought me to write this is that someone, I believe, wrote that the Three Weeks are driving him crazy and he may do something seriously wrong.

I think that the issur of "music" has to be understood and the halochically permissible therapeutic uses of it understood and taken into account more than they are.

I am quite convinced that if the Three Weeks causes atzvus, the halochos that deal with those things that cause it, mainly music, should be limited or ignored. The inyan is aveilus not atzvus. ...One compromise is to allow one who is feels this way to listen via headphones, which does not cause as much simcha as with speakers.

Serious aveiros aside, again the inyan is aveilus, not atzvus. If anyone is overly depressed, or maybe at all depressed, as compared to sad, I don't see the big problem if he keeps in mind various things. Things such as alternatives, using only headphones, what type of music.

It is better to ask a rov, but as with eating on a ta'anis, only a person himself knows his own tza'ar and should not fool himself, one way or the other. If the purpose is just to keep one from becoming angry or other therapeutic reasons, same thing.

The best thing would be to be able to consult someone who knows the halochos, understands

music and psychology. We must do our best in the absence of such individuals. There are still great people among us who can guide us.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by Pintele Yid - 14 Jul 2009 19:54

Esnachto,

I once heard a tape from Rav Yisroel Belsky who spoke out very strongly against listening (in the 3 weeks and till lag baomer) to the Acapela CDs that contain only voices but no instruments. He felt that some were so nice, it totally disregarded the purpose of not listening to music and was Ossur.

He added one caviat. For those who need music or will end up depressed, they are Mutar to listen to these CDs and should listen. I am not sure if he was Matir regular CDs, but although I am not a poisek, it is poshut to my klain kepela that if the non-instrumental CDs don't do the trick, then it should be Mutar to listen to regular music if that stops a person from getting depressed.

Pintela Yid

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by Efshar Letaken - 14 Jul 2009 20:40

Esnachto,

I was driving back from the Mountains the other day when this thought popped into my head & you might have a point there of cores as you said "ask your Local Rov!

But then I took it a step further.

Yes! Music lifts the spirit, but if we really want to lift are spirit we can get there with being close to Hashem, which can be done in many ways.

Studying Torah, Praying with Kavono, Brachos with Kavono, Guarding your Eyes & anytime we overcome the Y"H Ahhhh Gevald does that feel good. Looking at Hashems creations, the mountains, The Sky on a nice day, Flowers, Chirping Birds just to mention a few.

We can be uplifted in so many ways and not be B'Atsvus!

Believe me I'm a Music Addict (one more addiction to work on, lol) and used to give myself this heter, but I decided to try to be happy & uplifted in other ways so that I'm not B'Atsvus & at the same time really feel the loss of are Holy Beis Hamikdash every time I want my Music (and I want it a lot) I get to think of why I can't have it & what we are missing so when I say V'Yerushaliam Ercha B'Rachmim Toshuv I really mean it & hopefully if we show Hashem that we want it back we will get it back very soon.

I Hope I can do it! I'm sure I can! I just have to take things more serious & not try to find a way out of everything.

That said, I'm sure that if it is the Music that will stop you from A Fall then there's no question that the Music is a Tofel & the Aveirah is a Ikar & let the Music Blast!

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by UTS - 14 Jul 2009 21:38

Here is an interview with Rav Belsky shlitch on the subject of Acaplla music which I found enlightening.

One of the points here is that what is called A'capella music nowadays is not necessarily A'capella music. It can be actual music.

I don't remember the Rov saying anything about atzvus in this interview, it's about what A'capella really is, and other related things.

matzav.com/p'sak-from-rav-yisroel-belsky-and-rav-shlomo-miller-on-acappella-music-during-the-three-weeks/

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by chl - 14 Jul 2009 22:31

bs"d

this is a great thread! I feel very much like E.T. on the subject, but Esnachtos point is very valid in my opinion.

Also, as i mentioned somewhere else, for a different non-atzvus take on bein hametzarim and tisha b'av look into R.Z.M. Zilberbergs sefer on Devarim. I used to dread the three weeks, but after reading his take on it, one almost feels this is one of the greatest times of the year.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by UTS - 15 Jul 2009 04:24

[chl wrote on 14 Jul 2009 22:31:](#)

bs"d

this is a great thread! I feel very much like E.T. on the subject, but Eshnachos point is very valid in my opinion.

Also, as i mentioned somewhere else, for a different non-atzvus take on bein hametzarim and tisha b'av look into R.Z.M. Zilberbergs sefer on Devarim. I used to dread the three weeks, but after reading his take on it, one almost feels this is one of the greatest times of the year.

I would not encourage someone who does not need it to listen to music. Everyone is different. This applies to the whole year maybe, but certainly now and especially the Nine Days.

However, someone who does need it should not hesitate and wait until sha'as nisoyon.....

And in general, depression (moroh shchoroh) and atzvus are very harmful to avodas Hashem.

All of this has to be taken into account by every yochid, and their rov. I don't think every rov appreciates that there is much depression and the like out there. Not necessarily clinical.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by bardichev - 15 Jul 2009 14:49

AVEILUS FOR THE CHURBAN IS ACHELEK OF AVODAS HASHEM

THERE IS NO PART OF AVODAS HASHEM THAT IS DONE OR LEADS TO ATZVUSS
DEPRESSION

IF YOU NEED MUSIC FOR YOUR SANITY SPEAK TO A RABBI

THIS IS A VERY SPECIAL TIME OF THE YEAR

I WILL TRY TO ELABORATE IN THE B"M

BTW THE MINHAG IN YERUSHALAYIM IS NEVER TO HAVE LIVE MUSIC

LISTENING TO LIVE MUSIC ACCORDING TO REB MOSHE FIENSHTIEN ZT"L IS
PROHIBITED

ONE MORE IT IS ASSUR TO LISTEN TO LIVE MUSIC WHILE EATING A MEAL REGARDING
CD'S ETC FIND OUT FROM YOUR POSEK

YOU WILL BE SURPRISED THERE ARE MANY HALACHOS AND MINHAGIM HERE

I WRITE THIS NOT TO CREATE CONTROVERSEY JUST TO LET YOU KNOW THAT
MINHAG HAOLAM IS NOT ALWAYS THE WAY IT IS SUPPOSED TO BE

PARTING SHOT: AVEILUS AND TZAAR HASCHINA HAS ZILCH ZERO NADA TO DO WITH
ATZVUSS!!!

b

=====

====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by chl - 15 Jul 2009 15:43

bs"d

Heiliger bardichever,

Rav Nachman Breslover taught that when learning hilchos aveylus in the shulchan aruch one should not delve too deeply. He also taught how important it is to get up for chatzos and mourn the destruction of the Temple, (and except for some Sfardi communities, i don't know anybody except for the Breslovers who do this (or at least try to) on a broad and regular basis).

I do think that aveylus, if misunderstood, or mispracticed can lead to depression and atzvus (i know that from my own experience). Only after learning Rav Zvi Meir's sefer on Dvarim was i able to shift perspective. I remember once on Tisha bav mourning so strongly and getting so much in atzvus, stronger and stronger that something very unpleasant happened. Rav Zvi Meir's sefer really helped me.

I don't listen to music during the three weeks (and i work with music). As E.T. said, every time i want to listen to music, and i stop myself, it reminds why we don't listen to music. I think about the tsar haShechina, about the golus. About Geula and Mashiah.

But i also understand that if someone is depressed or can not hold there for whatever reason then a halachik solution should be found for him or her.

The old yishuv here in Yerushalyim and their descendants have a poiker and one or two singers at their weddings. They also do have live music on sukkos and on purim (as a musician i discussed this with various people in Meah Shearim whose families have been living here for generations). The more traditional refrain from whole 4-5 piece bands. But i saw Menacham Herman playing on Kikar Shabbes on Sukkos with his entire band.

Today many people, including sincerely religious ones, live here in Jerusalem who do not have

these traditions, and never grew up that way. We live in times where music is all over - unlike the times of the big poskim (Rambam and Rama) on whom most of our halachik attitude towards music today is based. In their times (live) music was present only at weddings or simchas (or goyishe taverns). Today's poskim need to take into consideration how the times and the world changed. F.ex. some poskim matir to listen to a specific type of music while working out. A driver can listen to music to prevent him from falling asleep.

(www.vbm-torah.org/3weeks/mf.htm).

Here is a discussion about singing: www.yeshiva.org.il/midrash/shiur.asp?id=8332

I am not a talmid chacham, and this is just my opinion. As you said there are many halachos and minhagim, and solutions can be found for different people.

respectfully,

chl

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by bardichev - 15 Jul 2009 16:43

holy chl

every word you said is true

i only refrenced this topic to show that ii is was that has alot more going on than what meets the eye (and ears)

The heiliger OHR HACHAIM QUOTES" The chassid is one who mourns in his heart,but has joy on his face"

may we all SEE the nechama of Tzion and not need these problems.

As the Heiliger Rizhiner said "Hashem If you do not like this Yom Tov (Tishaa Bav) You can take it away"

bardichev

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by chl - 15 Jul 2009 17:29

bs"d

Thanks bardichev for your reply!

[bardichev wrote on 15 Jul 2009 16:43:](#)

may we all SEE the nechama of Tzion and not need these problems.

Amen!

love,

chl

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by me - 15 Jul 2009 20:09

I am not a Rav, but I still have a little common sense left over....a little.

The mitzvah of the 3 weeks has NOTHING to do with sadness, but rather "less Simcha". We should lessen our simcha, (ivdu es hashem b'simcha...tamid)...but now still do the "ivdu", but with less simcha.

If one is in atvut, they cannot be an oved Hashem, and not only this but the shechinah does NOT dwell with one who is in atvut. (Remember yakov Avinu who was down for 22 years, and the shechinah had left him, until he met Yosef once again)

If a person is falling, or getting into a state of anxiety, depression etc. which we ALL know does lead us to desire the triggers, then it is a mitzva, or one is even M'choiev to listen to music if they know that this will help. Remember I once brought down in the name of the Baal Shomer Emunim, that one can even think in Torah while in the sherutim, (in a case when they are attacked with hirhurim). Need I go further.

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by bardichev - 16 Jul 2009 03:34

just to keep the HALACHIC discussion alive there is a teshuvah from Reb Moishe Zt"l

regarding if someone who is nebbach participating in mixed dancing if he has a chiyuv to remove his yarmulka

of course you need to see the teshuvah inside to appreciate it and to see how The Tzaddik's heart bled for every yid

But Reb Moishe says we never push away a halacha for a halacha even a yarmulka is a minhag it should not be pushed away.

Again I am not paskening the music question I am only quoting this teshuvah because I saw it today and it remindede me of the music question

b

=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by UTS - 19 Jul 2009 18:29

[bardichev wrote on 15 Jul 2009 14:49:](#)

AVEILUS FOR THE CHURBAN IS ACHELEK OF AVODAS HASHEM

THERE IS NO PART OF AVODAS HASHEM THAT IS DONE OR LEADS TO ATZVUSS
DEPRESSION

IF YOU NEED MUSIC FOR YOUR SANITY SPEAK TO A RABBI

THIS IS AVERY SPECIALTIME OF THE YEAR

I WILL TRY TO ELABORATE IN THE B"M

BTW THE MINHAG IN YERUSHALAYIMIS NEVER TO HAVE LIVE MUSIC

LISTENING TO LIVE MUSIC ACCORDING TO REB MOSHE FIENSHTIEN ZT"L IS PROHIBITED

ONE MORE IT IS ASSUR TO LISTEN TO LIVE MUSIC WHILE EATING A MEAL REGARDING CD'S ETC FIND OUT FROM YOUR POSEK

YOU WILL BE SURPRISED THERE ARE MANY HALACHOS AND MINHAGIM HERE

I WRITE THIS NOT TO CREATE CONTROVERSEY JUST TO LET YOU KNOW THAT MINHAG HAOLAM IS NOT ALWAYS THE WAY IT IS SUPPOSED TO BE

PARTING SHOT: AVEILUS AND TZAAR HASCHINA HAS ZILCH ZERO NADA TO DO WITH ATZVUSS!!!

b

Dear Bardithev,

You seem to be angry ("parting shot", capitalized letters throughout, etc.) at what I or others wrote.

Let me try to dispell some of it.

What you say is correct about the proper kavonoh and approach we **should have** to this situation (the Churbon) and this time of the year. However, not everyone, probably not even most of us, really understand the proper hashkofos and the halochos etc. involved, or are on the madregoh needed for this. Also, some people are depressed anyway, and this time of year can be more upsetting than the Torah would want. Maybe the heter of "*Istenis*" in regard to cleanliness would bring this matter into clearer focus. If someone is an *istenis*, he can do things that someone else cannot, al pi halochoh. That does not mean that he does not have the proper sensitivities to the situation. Even Hillel went to the *merchatz* when he was an oveil because he was an *istenis*.

Let's be honest with ourselves. We are here on this site because we do not believe every thing that we say we do. At least we do to *some* extent, or we would not be here. That may be all that the Eishbesther wants, now at any rate. And maybe not. We do not know. We say that we have a feeling for the tza'ar of the Shechinoh. Anyone who has not done tshuvoh on the matters of shmiras habris ve'ainaim could not possibly have such tz'a'ar anywhere near what it should be, if at all. Tz'ar Hashchinoh ?? What about the very fact that G-d exists?! Would we do these aveiros in front of people? Here we are doing it in front of G-d !!!!! Right in front of G-d who tells us how terrible these things are.

.... However, this just means that we need the lack of music to help us. We cannot try to change halochoh. However, what I am saying is that halochoh takes into consideration what I am writing about.

In Yerusholayim, they do not listen to live music at *chasunos*. As far as I know, that is the **only** time they do not do so, more than anywhere else.

Reb Moishe permitted a person in a mental hospital to listen to music if it would be therapeutic. I saw that a long time ago, but I think that he wrote something quite close to that. Others are more matir anytime.

Chl's post also was helpful in explaining some misunderstood and not well known facts and ideas.

We must be careful not to exaggerate heteirim or issurim.

This may clarify some things I for one said. Controversy can be a good thing. Milchamtoch shel torah, when real, is always good.

Sincerely,

Esnachtoh

=====
=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus
Posted by Dov - 19 Jul 2009 20:03

Here is a maymar from Rav Simcha Bumin Miprashischo (oy vei are there a lot of ways to spell that town!) that is related to your conversation (though not exactly on target):

(Teh. 147)

Harofeh lishvurei leiv (He is the Healer of people w/broken hearts) - "Hoy!" Asks the Rebbe Reb Bunim: "What is so bad about nishberei leiv that Hashem wants to heal them? I thought He loves a leiv nishbar (as it says all over the place)!!?"

...comes the rest of the posuk to explain:

Umechabeish le'atzvosam (and he places bandages/binds up their sadness) "Sad? Who said anything about Him liking sadness? If our broken heart leads to sadness, that is a problem! We will need Hashem to heal up the sadness so we can retain our pure broken hearts, broken so they are open to Hashem, but w/o *any* sadness c"v!!" annswered the Rebbe.

Now *that* takes siyata diShmaya! :D

=====
=====

Re: Three Weeks and Atzvus

Posted by UTS - 19 Jul 2009 22:59

[Efshar Letaken wrote on 14 Jul 2009 20:40:](#)

Esnachto,

I was driving back from the Mountains the other day when this thought popped into my head & you might have a point there of cores as you said "ask your Local Rov!

But then I took it a step further.

Yes! Music lifts the spirit, but if we really want to lift are spirit we can get there with being close to Hashem, which can be done in many ways.

Studying Torah, Praying with Kavono, Brachos with Kavono, Guarding your Eyes & anytime we overcome the Y"H Ahhhh Gevald does that feel good. Looking at Hashems creations, the mountains, The Sky on a nice day, Flowers, Chirping Birds just to mention a few.

We can be uplifted in so many ways and not be B'Atsvus!

Believe me I'm a Music Addict (one more addiction to work on, lol) and used to give myself this heter, but I decided to try to be happy & uplifted in other ways so that I'm not B'Atsvus & at the same time really feel the loss of are Holy Beis Hamikdash every time I want my Music (and I want it a lot) I get to think of why I can't have it & what we are missing so when I say V'Yerushaliam Ercha B'Rachmim Toshuv I really mean it & hopefully if we show Hashem that we want it back we will get it back very soon.

I Hope I can do it! I'm sure I can! I just have to take things more serious & not try to find a way out of everything.

That said, I'm sure that if it is the Music that will stop you from A Fall then there's no question that the Music is a Tofel & the Aveirah is a Ikar & let the Music Blast!

What I was trying to say was that I don't think it's such a problem in the first place that has to be avoided as if it's yae'horeg ve'al ya'vor. Of course, all within the framework of halochoh.

=====

====