

Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by Kedusha - 12 Nov 2010 15:45

Disclaimer: Nothing posted on this thread, or anywhere else on the forum, should be relied upon for Halacha l'Maseh. As to whether a Sheilah should be asked, see replies # 110 & 112.

[Note that the first few pages of this thread relate to an earlier version of this poll. Many of the issues raised have been addressed in the way the question is currently worded].

What do you say, Chevra? This is a question that has been on my mind for quite some time.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 16:22

Briut,

I took down the poll, so forget about how it was worded. But, see reply #19 for an explanation as to why this may be permitted even without it being a matter of Pikuach Nefashos.

(See also reply #21 for a greater understanding as to how this actually can be Pikuach Nefashos for some people).

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by the.guard - 14 Nov 2010 17:51

[Kedusha wrote on 14 Nov 2010 16:22:](#)

I took down the poll, so forget about how it was worded.

Shucks, I was just about to vote!!

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 17:58

[guardureyes wrote on 14 Nov 2010 17:51:](#)

[Kedusha wrote on 14 Nov 2010 16:22:](#)

I took down the poll, so forget about how it was worded.

Shucks, I was just about to vote!!

I'm not sure if you're serious, but I put it back up in modified form.

Everyone, now's your chance to vote (or to vote again, if you voted in the previous

gilgulim of this poll).

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by briut - 14 Nov 2010 18:21

[Kedusha wrote on 14 Nov 2010 04:11:](#)

1.) Where there is no danger to life, but the person is Nafal l'Mishkav ("incapacitated"), it is permitted for a Jew to perform [Melacha].

[...] A person who cannot function normally because of a psychological disorder, such as depression or anxiety, is also considered to be incapacitated [...] I think it's reasonable to categorize someone in recovery from a sex/lust addiction [...] as a person who cannot function normally [...] because, were he to relapse [...] his ability to function normally may be seriously compromised [...]

Sorry, Kedusha, I'm still not convinced. Let's take any of the other 12-step addictions. If that OA/Soveya addict is about to grab some kugel that might cause a heart attack, it's worth a call?? If the AA member decides a shalom zochor is important enough for just one drink, it's worth a call?? Yes, they can't pull together proper bechira, but it's not outside the realm of normal FUNCTIONING.

I always understood "normal functioning" to be like the medical term of "independent activities of daily living." So if the guy can put his pants on in the morning, and his only problem is keeping those hands out of those pants, I have my doubts that the halachic hurdles are met. He's not in danger from not functioning, but only in danger of not functioning al pi halacha. Which doesn't convince me.

But, as you say, this is a sheileh for poskim and not a poll for addicts. I'd only add that the sheileh must be presented fully, honestly, and with integrity. Which means, it da**ed well better be presented before the moment before the moment of no return. Which ones of us have the to do that?!

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 18:25

I don't see why relapsing to any addiction would be less serious than the examples Rav Bodner gives (depression or anxiety - where there is not even a Safek Sakana) - see reply #19.

The point, for the food addict, is not that he'll eat one piece of kugel, but that he'll be binge-eating for who knows how long and his sobriety will be completely derailed.

As for the alcoholic, I maintain that an alcoholic losing his sobriety is at least Safek Pikuach Nefashos. However, at the very least, it would fall into the category of incapacitation, discussed in reply #19.

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 18:26

Update: It is now possible to change your vote, in case anyone changes his mind.

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by briut - 14 Nov 2010 18:30

[Kedusha wrote on 14 Nov 2010 18:25:](#)

I don't see why relapsing to any addiction would be less serious ...
We could play what I'd call "duck season, rabbit season" for days, but I'll refrain from further comment. Feel free to PM if you'd like to know how to shecht a rabbit.

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 18:33

Again, I plan, b'li neder, to try to ask this question to a Posek who is willing to be quoted on the record. I think it needs to be asked in advance, because b'shaas ma'aseh, "Hasho'el Harei Zeh Shofech Damim."

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by briut - 14 Nov 2010 18:37

Hunnh? Your Poll is now worded: If your only way to avoid losing a long streak of sobriety was to call a non-Jewish sponsor on Shabbos, would you do so? Assume that, al pi Halacha, there is ample authority to permit this?

And sorry to flog this dead horse to death, but I'll add one more PS.

You seem to be assuming there's not a way to reach out that would NOT violate Shabbos. Like maybe living in a town without any possibility to walk to a sponsor, GYE member, shrink, etc. Are you sure there's no one in your town who could qualify? Again, PM me if you want any hints.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 19:00

Say there's two feet of snow on the ground (remember last winter?), and my trusted frum sponsor or chaver lives several miles away. Let's be practical here.

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos

Posted by Eye.nonymous - 14 Nov 2010 19:47

CAN YOU USE TELEPATHY WITH A GRAMA SWITCH (that's the switch that only grama is allowed to use) TO REACH OUT TO A NON-JEW ON SHABBOS IF YOU'RE ABOUT TO FALL?

--Eye.

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by frumfiend - 14 Nov 2010 21:02

alcoholics are told to drive to meetings on shabbos. (I was told by an alcoholic that this was his psak)

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by Kedusha - 14 Nov 2010 21:20

Makes sense, because for an alcoholic, it's Pikuach Nefashos, literally. In our case, I don't know about driving, which involves countless Melachos d'Oraysa, but I don't have any doubts about using the phone with a Shinuy, for the reasons discussed in reply #19.

=====

=====

Re: Reaching Out for Help on Shabbos
Posted by bardichev - 14 Nov 2010 22:09

lock this topic

=====

=====