

R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 13 Nov 2011 09:55

[Moderator's note: The controversial article that was posted here purports to present Rav Tzadok's views. Some of the general statements are indeed classic Rav Tzadok, but other statements appear so far from normative Halacha and Hashkafa that I'm not convinced that Rav Tzadok actually wrote them, or intended them for public consumption. The danger of quoting from unpublished manuscripts is that such quotes are difficult to verify].

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by kidushashem - 13 Nov 2011 13:14

strivingforhonesty,

If I understood correctly, you are not the author of this article so I don't put blame on you for it's contents but I would like to stress that I find this article very disturbing. I admit that I have not read any of this in it's source so I can't really debate whether it's authentic or not however, besides for the obviously controversial contents which are claimed to be authored by R' Tzadok, the person commentating certainly takes the liberty of using such phrases as: "In a tone of desperation,he writes" and: "he repeats himself obsessively as if, through repetition, to prove it to himself". Reading this article, these sentences turned on red lights. Another red light : "or on Yom Kippur it is also a good sign indicating forgiveness, or indicating that a person has been accepted into the world to come." Really? I thought we said the 4 chapters of Tehillim on YK night to make sure we don't have Keri, certainly not masturbation...

While I am no Torah authority, all of the above, along with claims that unmarried people are not really sinning when m***, leads me to be extremely cautious in approaching this article and I would appreciate any clarification. I am sure this is not the first time someone has brought up such a confounding article.

Moderators?

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 13 Nov 2011 14:30

Hi, a lot of people will find the points here controversial, I suppose that's why R Zadok's works were censored!

I have been fortunate enough to read the uncensored books in a library, and I can't see any place where Dr Rosenfeld misquoted R Zadok unfortunately I don't own a copy, otherwise I would send it to you.

As for as ejaculation being a good sign, you will have to try get hold of Tzidkat HaTzaddik, the unedited one and check out chapter 42, number 105.

it is important for me to point out that you are misquoting her when you write "along with claims that unmarried people are not really sinning when m****" she never said that she said "On

some level, the true prohibition of masturbation does not lie in one who masturbates

while single" in a foot note to this she writes "R. Zadok is not the first to have this idea?it has its roots in the Tosafists, and gets taken even further by the innovative position of R. Avraham David Warman of Buczacz (18th-19th century, student of the hasidic rabbi R. Levi Yitzhak of Berdichev); see Pachter 266-71, and Rones 185-91."

Kidushashem, the article I posted is part of a whole work written by a frum lady who did a study on frum singles and there struggles, I have the entire work and it has been a tremendous held to me, I actually know someone that was seeing prostitutes on a weekly basis, and this work was literally I life saver for him!

What is amazing about it is that she is not afraid to tackle sensitive issues head on, yet at the very same time she believes in the eternity of the unchanging halacha.

If you want I can send you a copy of the work.

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by mggsbms - 13 Nov 2011 15:19

I have seen all of these quotes from R' tzodok before and didnt come to the same understanding. The Dr is filling in alot of blank space, to me this is dangrous territory.

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by alexeliezer - 13 Nov 2011 17:10

There are many machlokisin (halachic arguments) in yiddishkeit.

We have a principle: Acharei rabim l'hatos -- we follow the majority opinion. In the days of the Sanhedrin, if a Rav continued to rule according to his minority opinion, he was put to death as a Zaken Mamrei (rebellious elder).

With all due respect, Rav Zadok is clearly not the majority opinion here.

There's nothing further to discuss.

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strugglingandstrivngBT - 13 Nov 2011 17:22

this is not saying that the act is mutter, it is just a second opinion to the hell fire raised by most sources trying to fight something that my therapist says that many people in the frum world are facing. its a boast of self confidence for those taht would be held down by depression in the wake of getting caught in our struggle. personally i see it as saying dont do it but if you do theres worse you could do. which is true.

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Serene smile - 13 Nov 2011 17:43

Once in an SA meeting someone more well versed in halacha than me said "it says in shulchan aruch (even ezra?) That if a man is for sure going to be in a forbidden sexual relationship, than it's better for him to do zera l'vatala".. I definitely heard this, but I'm only buky in pas and shoskim (bread and drinks), .. So if anyone has any knowledge about that halacha I'd be interested.. It's an interesting point which can help pick up spirits sometimes of a chaver wallowing in depression. That said, I don't want to masturbate and then have to look my kids in the eye.. And this was quite an article

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by kidushashem - 13 Nov 2011 18:17

[strivingforhonesty wrote on 13 Nov 2011 14:30:](#)

Kidushashem, the article I posted is part of a whole work written by a frum lady who did a study on frum singles and there struggles, I have the entire work and it has been a tremendous held to me, I actually know someone that was seeing prostitutes on a weekly basis, and this work was literally I life saver for him!

What is amazing about it is that she is not afraid to tackle sensitive issues head on, yet at the very same time she believes in the eternity of the unchanging halacha.

If you want I can send you a copy of the work.

I would love a copy! I'm sure people have been helped a lot by her work and I would love to be able to read it and know feel confident that it's in accordance with Halacha.

Thanks!

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by baalteshuva - 13 Nov 2011 18:27

Mgsbms-

You may have read Rav tzadoks works but did you get hold of the censored parts? They are not easily available, so I don't think the Dr is filling in the gaps.

alexeliezer-

in the days of the sanhedrin one would have to accept the halachic rulings of the sanhedrin, however one is not required to accept the thoughts behind that ruling, there is no "thought control in yidishkeit, if you don't believe me I can send you a letter I have from a talmid muvhak of Rav dessler...

I also have a copy of Dr Rosenfelds work, and it has helped me tremendously, I am now actually making shachrit with a minyan every morning!

I have struggled for a long time with guilt, and guilt over my "funny" attitudes towards masturbation (you might pick this up if you read some of my previous posts)

And her work has helped me a lot, and I'm actually masturbating a lot less!

In my humble opinion one of the values of her work is that once one accepts masturbation as the starting point for almost everyone, and once one understands that it is a basic human impulse, one is then able to distinguish between having a normal healthy desire to masturbate and having an addiction problem, and growing through both of them with the correct and appropriate tools,

More importantly one is not overwhelmed by masturbation, and one realizes that one can masturbate with out porn, and with out doing anything worse, then with a positive, relaxed and uplifted heart one can strive to grow in the challenge of even normal masturbation

=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by mggsbms - 13 Nov 2011 18:38

I think the question is who censored it and why. i highly doubt it was censored not to put R tzodok in a bad light, i would rather say it was censored because of the worry that people will come to the wrong conclusions not understanding the holy words of R tzodok. i have some problems with your latest post as well and will get to it later. i am not doubting that your aproach has helped you, but there is a difference in bringing out something that helped you and expousing it as normative hashkafa

=====

====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by strivingforhonesty - 13 Nov 2011 19:06

mgsbms-

The Rambam's works were burnt in his time, now which yeshiva today does not learn Rambam?

I am not sure why people will come to wrong conclusions, R Zadok is very explicit. Yes there is always a risk, but it is no more of a risk then any other work, you really. Should try look at the manuscripts, maybe try the Mendel Gottesman library at Yeshiva University, if you not to far away.

=====
=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Serene smile - 14 Nov 2011 00:40

This is quite a 'lebedike' thread in light of the frequently repeated statement of all the 'big rabbis' in my community that : "the yetzer hara doesn't want your averos! He wants your depression!".. So if some of this info does indeed give a boost of hope to many frum jews, then that's AMAZING! One of the most horrible/pathetic things for me personally, is to hear and read about over and over, how one 'frum' jew after another after another, is singing the "boo-hoo-hoo", "oh it's so bad" story over and over and over again, because of these issues..

My secular family and childhood was ruined completely by these issues in my dad, and it's SO disheartening to keep reading 'yet another' story of yidden 'coming clean for the 1st time' on GYE to 'finally try to stop living a double life' etc....

So I guess this post is 2 fold: A) how is it that ANY of these 'holy' yidden ever felt (very egotistically!) Better than my non'religious family????!!! And ever even had ONE machsavah that they are 'right' for feeling 'better than', and..

(the real reason for this post) BARUCH HASHEM for posts like this if they help the 'frum' jews be happy people (FINALLY!)....

(I'm BH frum now w/a happy family, and It's just mamosh sickening being surrounded by uptight depressed hypocrites who shockingly still hold on to some 'I'm above and better than' mentality over ANY OTHER JEW!?!?!)... GYE is the greatest proof of how 'clothes' and following in the 'customs of our fathers' do ZERO to improve our spirituality. Real ruchnius has to be emes and ANY YID has direct access to emes.. There's more to say and I'm tired for now.. (The 12th step says 'having had a spiritual awakening we sought to carry this message to others"... So if your yiddishkeit hasn't 'spiritually awakened' you enough to 'bring it to others, then I see almost no emes in your minor league yiddishkeit.. Which, as gye is proving over and over, is just a prtice in our own egos

=====

Re: R Zadok and the power of masturbation

Posted by obormottel - 16 Nov 2011 00:19

Thanks to moderator Kedusha for removing the article altogether, because now we have this great outburst:

<http://www.guardyoureyes.org/forum/index.php?topic=4763.msg125584#msg125584> so that was timely!

I am surprised not too many people joined in this controversial discussion, perhaps we are trying to avoid machloikes and bring Moshiach sooner.

Knowing my hot-headedness I waited a couple of days (except for a quick Tora-thought [here](#)), and if not for the above post I probably would have let it go, too.

The main question I have to the guy posting this article, is:

StrivingForHonesty, what is YOUR point?

Mimo nafshach:

If you're an addict, than masturbation is a self-destructive behaviour, that can and should be stopped, but it is not a religious issue at all.

If you're not an addict, than no matter how strong the urge, it is in our human capability to control this urge, as is proven daily by millions of religious men of all kinds of traditions who do not masturbate. So if you are a religious Jew, why look for an obscure manuscript that seems to justify your behaviour, when there are hundreds of explicit traditional writings that give it no justification at all?

Even if we assume that the purported writings do belong to the quill of R. Tzadok, nevertheless

1. They were not printed during the author's life time along with his other books - and that should raise a red flag.

2. There is no one, or hardly anyone, today, who calls himself a follower of R. Tzadok (zecher tzaddik l'vrocho ub'mechilas kvoidoi). His was a radical derech, and has never gained any ground. (Eliyahu Kitov is no proof:)) In other words, his teachings failed to withstand scholarly scrutiny and peer review, as holy and G-d-inspired as they were.

There are many holy midroshim and other books in our history which no one in their right mind would use for practical application.

So again, an unconfirmed daas yochid should not be a neir lehoir to anyone, let alone a frum Yid who is bound by Shulchon Oruch and accepted mesoiro.

But putting the religion aside for a second (and it is unfortunate that this Dr. and her article prompted some frum Jews here and elsewhere to come up with terms like "good masturbation" or confess to "masturbating a lot less" which to me sounds like "I keep every other Shabbos"), let's take a look at the preposition from addiction point of view.

This article, if I understood correctly, is written by a female therapist, who is allegedly "frum" and who is seemingly at pains to reconcile what they taught her in sikology classes (masturbating is a healthy human outlet and every man wants to and should do it) and Kitzur Shulchon Oruch or maseches Nida that calls masturbation a "murder".

So she finds an obscure, never-before-printed, unconfirmed authorship, manuscript that fits her own theory of reconcilliation, and goes for a run with it.

She doesn't know of wasting seed from her own experience. She has no personal knowledge of isolation and degradation that inevitably follows compulsive masturbation. She doesn't understand that a man's character gets thoroughly destroyed if he is given to the habit of self-pleasuring. That it makes a man incapable of properly relating to real life, real love, real sex.

Please raise your hand if you are a compulsive masturbator and you can make *slow* love to your partner.

The very idea of masturbation is *instant* gratification, and it does not matter whether it is natural or not: it wires one's brain to expect pleasure instantly, to negate effort in establishing a meaningful relationship, and it fools one into thinking that one must have it or else.

I have a friend who masturbates on Yom Kippur because he is convinced that it is impossible for him to fall asleep without orgasming first. And it's true, he can't fall asleep without it, but only because he *wired* his brain that way by doing it before going to sleep year after year.

Why should I try to intice my wife to have sex with me, if without any effort I can get the same result for myself, and if the woman wishes not to orgasm with me, too bad for her?

I don't care how natural is the urge for any given man to ejaculate as often as possible.

No one has ever died from abstinence. If it feels like you will die without "it", ask yourself if perhaps you are addicted.

Don't be "sitting on the fence". If you are a frum Jew, you control yourself on fast days from eating, on Shabbos from driving, and (if you're married) from "sexing" during that time of the month. If the urge to masturbate is out of control, maybe our problem is not a lack of proper Fear of Heaven. To go out of one's way to explain away a compulsive behavior sounds pretty much like an addiction to me.

Yes, a lot of boys discover a joy of easy orgasm before they know it's called "wasting seed". It's important to understand, that once we've grown up, learnt the definitions, and still can't control ourselves, then maybe it is no longer a natural urge, but an unnatural obsession that needs to be dealt with.

It is both immature and irresponsible (in the opinion of this sex addict) to bring "holy" sources to justify either a destructive habit or a full-blown addiction.

That's what I've been doing, anyways. But that's just another proof that I'm insane.

So again, Strivingforhonesty, what was your point? I got the Dr.'s part in it, but what is yours?

=====
=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by Kedusha - 16 Nov 2011 00:26

I read an article about the Ph.D., whose writings were cited in the removed post. Although there may be some kernels of truth in what she says, a number of things she is quoted as saying seem very far from a Torah Hashkafa and seem to distort Halacha as well. For example, whitewashing the issur of holding hands with a niddah; suggesting that Penuyos go the Mikvah to minimize the issur, which the Poskim have dealt with and forbidden. Also, talking disrespectfully about Amoraim.

=====
=====

Re: R Zadok and masturbation

Posted by obormottel - 16 Nov 2011 00:45

Exactly. Even the ~~quoted~~ removed article would not stand up to scrutiny from the standpoint of

true Toiro-Hashkofo, actual Kisvei HoArizal etc, I am sure of it.

But of course there are kernels of truth there, because that's the only way to make a big lie stick: insert something truthfull here and there so that no one can accuse you of total falsification.

=====

=====